

Media Representations of Immigration and Ethnic Diversity in the New Zealand Herald

Sandy Lee and Trudie Cain

Working Paper No. 1/2018

Massey University

December 2018







Copyright. © 2019 by CaDDANZ: Sandy Lee, Trudie Cain

- No part of this report may be reproduced in any form without written permission.
- All enquiries in

writing to:

CaDDANZ Research
Private Bag 102 904
North Shore Mail Centre
Auckland
New Zealand

ISSN 2624-4365 (Print) ISSN 2624-4330 (Online)

• See our website at: www.caddanz.org.nz

Contents

Acknowledgements	2
Executive Summary	3
Economic Benefit of Migration and Ethnic Diversity	3
The 'Burden' of Immigration on Infrastructure, Services and Housing	4
Fraud and Exploitation	5
Summary	5
Introduction	7
Method	8
Caveats and Limitations	8
Findings	9
Immigration Provides Economic Benefits for Auckland and New Zealand	9
Immigrant Labour is Vital for the Economy	9
Entrepreneurial Immigrants are Welcome and Celebrated	13
Summary	15
The 'Burden' of Immigration on Infrastructure, Services and Housing	16
Claims that Immigration Puts Undue Pressure on Infrastructure and Services	16
Claims that Immigration Places Undue Pressure on the Housing Market	18
Summary	20
Fraud and Exploitation	21
Immigration Fraud is a Serious Problem for Auckland	21
International Students are Framed as Vulnerable to Exploitation	24
Summary	25
Conclusion	26
References	28
Appendix: Bibliography	30

Acknowledgements

Massey University's Auckland Knowledge Exchange Hub (AKEH) facilitates knowledge exchange between the University and public and private entities, primarily in the Auckland region. A key area of interest for the Hub is Auckland's ethnic diversity and the extent to which this impacts on the city's economic and social development. We gratefully acknowledge AKEH's financial contribution to this project as well as financial support from the Capturing the Diversity Dividend of Aotearoa New Zealand (CaDDANZ) programme of research. Finally, we wish to thank Dr Jessica Terruhn who provided valuable feedback on earlier drafts, and Associate Professor Ann Dupuis who carried out preliminary work which contributed to this report.

Executive Summary

This report is concerned with the way the media, and the New Zealand Herald in particular, frame stories about immigration and ethnic diversity. 179 New Zealand Herald articles published between 1 June 2016 and 30 June 2017, and featuring the key words 'ethnic diversity' and/or 'immigration' were analysed to identify dominant discursive themes. Three major themes were identified: the economic benefit of migration; the burden or cost of immigration on infrastructure, services and housing; and fraud and exploitation.

Economic Benefit of Migration and Ethnic Diversity

A major theme identified from the New Zealand Herald articles was around the economy and the economic benefits of immigration for Auckland and New Zealand more generally. Nearly one-third of all articles made reference to positive contributions to the economy, with many attributing economic growth to immigration. There were two distinct ways the economic benefits of immigration and diversity were articulated in the articles: first was through the key role immigrants play in filling major shortages in the New Zealand labour market; and second was through the entrepreneurialism of immigrants.

Immigration was frequently portrayed as vital for addressing the country's labour shortages. Many of the Herald's reporters emphasised the importance of migrants in key industries such as in dairying, farming, horticulture, hospitality, age care and construction. Reporters drew on comments from industry leaders and spokespersons who expressed their concerns about the difficulties they experienced in meeting labour demands and thus the need to employ workers from overseas. Some articles suggested that the difficulty in filling jobs with local workers was because of reluctance and unwillingness from native-born New Zealanders to train and work in these key industries. Others, however, also suggested that migrants had a better work ethic than those born locally. Thus, for numerous reasons, maintaining high immigration numbers was largely presented positively because it indicated a healthy economy. Importantly, both justifications were underpinned by an economic imperative.

Articles discussing changes to the skilled migration requirements announced in April 2017 were often framed as attempts to increase the 'quality' of migrants rather than reducing numbers but were followed by articles reporting on the concerns of industry leaders that the policy would negatively impact their business and growth. Again, the dominant discourse underpinning these reports was to consider migrants not as human beings who work and live in this country but as an economic unit subject to a cost-benefit calculation. This utilitarian framing of migrants was notable in various articles, with suggestions that, while New Zealand might need the skills and economic resources from migrants, the country needed to be 'picky' about who might be invited. Given the status and authority of those being cited in these articles, the relative absence of migrants' voices, and the paucity of comments from either industry leaders or the Government concerned with the impact on the lives of migrants and their families, the dominant economic discourse normalises a view of immigration as solely about a diversity dividend for New Zealand.

Another way the economic value of immigrants was stressed in the articles was in reports of successful entrepreneurial activities of migrants. These emphasised either the benefit of migrant businesses or the related advantage of diversity that immigrants bring. Although these articles considered the positive economic contributions that immigrants make (which suggests, in turn, greater benefits to wider society), they continue to frame migrants through the lens of economic utility. The success of migrant businesses also framed diversity itself as an economic asset. This included being able to offer culturally distinct products and services to the market as well as the benefit of an ethnically diverse

workforce that introduce specific skills and knowledge that help build economically beneficial relationships. While some articles were subtler in their emphasis on the benefits of ethnic and cultural diversity, the discourse was nevertheless present.

Collectively, these articles reinforce the economic value of migrants and frame migrants as economic resources. Though the economic portrayal may frame immigration in a more positive light, there is a risk that a narrow focus on the economic benefits fails to encourage greater acceptance of difference beyond utilitarian motives. As we have highlighted, immigrants are seen as important and necessary sources of labour for the nation's key industries and as successful entrepreneurs and business owners who contribute directly and indirectly to the economy. The overriding justification for the presence of immigrants is therefore their capacity to contribute economically. This dominant discourse is reiterated not only by the New Zealand born population, but has also been internalised and reinforced by migrants themselves who emphasise the unique set of skills and knowledge they add to businesses for a competitive edge.

The 'Burden' of Immigration on Infrastructure, Services and Housing

The second major theme identified in the NZ Herald articles was about a perceived burden or cost of immigration on infrastructure, services and housing, with more than 40 articles referencing these issues. Though economic benefits legitimised the high levels of immigration and helped cast it in a positive light, there were major concerns expressed in the articles around the impacts high immigration had on the ground. Almost two thirds of these articles referred to the pressures of immigration on infrastructure and roads. The 'rampant growth' of Auckland was frequently reported as unsustainable and in need of better planning. The metaphors used by reporters to describe the situation included descriptions of the city 'bursting at the seams', with 'creaking infrastructure', roads that are 'choked', as well as the city 'sinking' under extreme population size pressures. All these metaphors conjure images of the city being at maximum capacity and on the verge of total collapse, due, supposedly, to the number of immigrants settling in the city.

The majority (80 percent) of the articles that referred directly to the relationship between immigration and pressures on infrastructure used terms other than 'immigrants' or 'migrants' to attribute responsibility. Reporters and the experts they cited used terms such as 'net migration', 'immigration figures', 'immigration policy', 'record migration', 'immigration' and 'high migration' to talk about the issues which included worsening traffic congestion and the lack of affordable housing. This rhetorical strategy ostensibly avoids assigning blame for all the issues to immigrants themselves and rather highlights immigration policy as the problem. However, while focusing the discourse on immigration policy may help to rhetorically shelter immigrants from the blame, it also neglects the fact that the discussions are, nevertheless, still about immigrants – as individuals and their ability to live and work, or not, in the city. By not discussing the issues specifically in relation to immigrants, it has the unintended consequence of effectively denying immigrants their humanity; like the dominating economic discourse discussed previously, this abstraction obfuscates the basic needs, desires and rights of migrants.

Another major concern frequently stoked in the media was the impact of immigration on housing prices and availability in Auckland. Despite reporting on studies showing that no conclusive evidence exists to support the assertion that high immigration is pushing up house prices, this evidence did not appear to destabilise the prevailing discourse. Of the more than 30 articles that made some reference to the issue, only approximately one quarter highlighted the multifaceted nature of Auckland's rapidly increasing house prices. These articles emphasised low interest rates, investor demand, capital gains expectations and New Zealanders returning from overseas as the main drivers for the inflated house

prices instead of immigration, pointing to the fact that net migration numbers are predominantly made up of students and temporary migrants who are more likely to rent than buy property.

The debate about immigration and the impact on housing is also a political one and the inclusion of quotes from key politicians helped to normalise the assumption that immigration is pushing up house prices. Numerous articles cited statements from politicians, and the power and authority of their discourses help validate and normalise the view that immigration is the cause of rising house prices, particularly in the absence of any conclusive findings in the articles to corroborate it.

The framing of immigration in relation to infrastructure, services and housing in Auckland has contributed to the dehumanisation of immigrants. The dominant discourses portray 'high immigration' as the source of the city's traffic congestion, the inadequate provision of health care and schools, and the inflated house prices that are unaffordable for 'everyday Kiwis', and thus reducing immigration numbers is framed as the solution. Discussing the problems in relation to immigration policy may help mitigate against accusations of blatant discrimination against certain groups of people, but the abstraction nevertheless implies that immigrants are taking up scarce resources and 'burdening' the city. Importantly, the discourse also denies immigrants of their fundamental humanity and multidimensional needs and rights. Considering this in conjunction with the economic imperative normalised in the articles, it constructs and reduces immigrants to merely economic objects whose utility should be maximised for the benefit of the country.

Fraud and Exploitation

Fraud and exploitation was the third major theme identified in the articles on immigration and ethnic diversity, with more than 50 articles in the one-year period reporting on such stories. The articles included a range of criminal offences such as money laundering, drug smuggling, deception, cases of domestic violence, and sexual assault, but the most frequent were cases of immigration fraud and the exploitation of migrant workers which accounted for more than three-quarters of the articles. Incidences of immigration fraud reported in the articles ranged in size and severity. A small number were cases of individuals submitting false passports to either enter or remain in the country, while others were more serious offences involving and impacting significant numbers of people. Cases of immigration fraud were often closely linked to the exploitation of migrant workers in New Zealand, specifically in the hospitality and retail industries.

While migrants may be sources of labour for many of the nation's key industries, many articles shine light on the vulnerabilities of migrants who might find themselves trapped in illegal activity through their immigration officers or be the unwitting victim of exploitative practices. Interestingly, however, it was also suggested that the victims of such criminal activity was not the migrant but rather the citizens (not residents) of New Zealand whose borders had been crossed illegally. This latter position, alongside the seemingly ubiquitous focus on migrants' involvement in the labour market, suggests an understanding of immigration as solely for the interests of established New Zealanders with a clear disregard for the experiences and lives of the migrants concerned.

Summary

These dominant discourses reveal paradoxical concerns that stem largely from the normalisation of economic imperatives that underpinned changes to immigration policy in 1987 (Spoonley & Bedford, 2012). This is evident in the interests in maximising the economic benefits of immigration as well as, to a far lesser extent, the concurrent concerns about the welfare of immigrants. But it is instructive to consider the influence the economic reductionism and dehumanisation of immigrants might have on

the experiences and lives of migrants here and the extent to which it excludes 'the other' from the community and exposes them to the potential of violence and inhumane treatment. Given the power that mainstream media has in moulding public perceptions and opinions (Happer & Philoa, 2013), casting immigrants as dehumanised economic objects may diminish our collective capacity to extend compassion towards the other and may facilitate support for policies that disregard the rights, needs, aspirations, and humanity of immigrants.

Introduction

Media performs an important role informing public knowledge about social issues. As noted by Bleich, Bloemraad and Graauw (2015, p. 857), the media 'provide a communicative bridge between political and social actors, influence perceptions of pressing issues, depict topics and people in particular ways and may shape individuals' political views and participation'. Although print media has decreased significantly in popularity (Fresne, 2017), it undoubtedly remains an important contributor to public debate about contemporary social issues.

This report presents the findings of a research project that examined the way that media, in particular, the New Zealand Herald, framed stories about ethnic diversity and immigration in Tāmaki Makaurau Auckland over a one-year period (1 July 2016 to 30 June 2017). The primary purpose of the study was to identify the dominant discursive themes that were drawn on when journalists wrote about these issues and consider the key messages that were advanced to a broad readership.

There are two key reasons that this study is timely. First, with a population of 1.65 million, Auckland is New Zealand's most populated city and experiences continued population growth (Auckland Council, 2017). Between 2011 and 2016, the city's population increased by 10.6 percent and in 2016, the city gained an additional 44,500 people. This growth is primarily fuelled by migration with 30,800 new migrants arriving in the city in 2016 (Auckland Council, 2017). Moreover, high levels of migration from a range of source countries has resulted in Auckland becoming the most ethnically diverse city in New Zealand and one of the most ethnically diverse cities in the world, behind Dubai, Brussels and Toronto (International Organization for Migration, 2015). While historically New Zealand attracted immigrants from the United Kingdom, changes to immigration policy in 1986/87 led to the arrival of migrants from a broader range of source countries, including increased arrivals from China (currently 8.9% of the total population of Auckland), India (7.9%) and, more recently, the Philippines. Indeed, according to the 2013 Census (Stats NZ, 2017), nearly 40 percent of Auckland residents were born overseas and there are more ethnic groups represented in this city than there are countries in the world (213 in total) with more than 160 languages spoken (English being most common followed by Samoan (58,200 speakers), Hindi (49,518 speakers) and Chinese (38,781 speakers) (Stats NZ, 2017).

The circumstances of people's arrival in New Zealand is also more varied than ever, leading to Auckland often being described as *superdiverse*, a term coined by Steven Vertovec (2007) to capture the increasing complexity of urban societies in a globalised world. New settlers arrive under a range of visa conditions (student, work to residence, essential skills, parent retirement resident and investor visas, for example) which shape their settlement practices and experiences. Migrants represent a range of ages, religious affiliations and language groups, represent a multiplicity of lifestyles, attitudes and activities (Tasan-Kok, van Kempen, Raco, & Bolt, 2013) and often maintain economic, social and emotional connections with their country of origin. As such, contemporary migration patterns produce relationships that are 'layered and relational' (Gooder, 2017, p. 23) – between older and newer migrant groups; between Māori and non-Māori; between young and older residents, and, equally, within Aotearoa New Zealand and elsewhere around the world. These new diversities are significant in terms of how people choose to live together in a city or neighbourhood, but also in terms of urban policies and governance (Auckland Council, 2018).

The second key reason that this research is timely is that surprisingly little scholarship has focused on the role of print media in constructing prominent ideas about ethnic diversity, immigration and immigrants in a New Zealand context. International research has shown that positively framed articles can reduce resistance from a wide readership towards immigration (van Klingeren, Boomgaarden, Vliegenthart, & Vreese, 2015) and greater visibility of migrants in local media can generate a stronger

presence of migrant groups in domestic politics (Bloemraad, Graauw, & Hamlin, 2015). Other international scholarship has revealed less positive outcomes: the prevalence of negative stereotypes can produce a moral panic about immigration (Banda & Mawadza, 2015) and reinforce problematic perceptions of Muslims, for example, as different, strange, and threatening (Saeed, 2007) and "outside [the] mainstream" (Aly, 2016, p. 27). In the New Zealand context, Maydell (2016, p. 335) has found that the media often construct limited, stereotyped and 'unfavourable images' of ethnic minority groups while Smith's (2016, p. 694) media content analysis revealed that the media 'reproduced and legitimated the political and public discourse of elite groups that disassociated immigrant groups from mainstream New Zealanders'. Globally, we have witnessed the rise of populism and political rhetoric that constructs immigration and immigrants as socially, culturally and economically threatening (de Vreese, Esser, Aalberg, Reinemann, & Stanyer, 2018). In the local context, the run up to the New Zealand elections (September 2017) did not feature the "negative polarising debates about immigrants that characterised recent elections in the United Kingdom, the United States of America and, to a lesser extent, Australia" (Bedford & Didham, 2018) and yet better understanding the role of the media in representing and constructing perceptions of immigration and ethnic diversity, and, indeed, shaping a 'modern liberal democracy', is vital (Bleich, Bloemraad, & de Graauw, 2015).

Method

The project began with a website search of New Zealand Herald articles for the period 1 July 2016 to 30 June 2017 (http://www.nzherald.co.nz/) using the key words 'ethnic diversity' and 'immigration'. In all, 518 articles were identified and read to determine their relevance to the study. Relevance was determined by the article's focus on, and engagement with, key issues associated with ethnic diversity and/or immigration specifically in Tāmaki Makaurau. Articles that were only peripherally related to immigration or diversity issues were discarded. This process eliminated nearly 350 articles leaving 179 articles as the final data source (see Bibliography for full list and links to articles). The final list of articles comprised opinion pieces from a range of academics, politicians, business leaders, social justice advocates and other professionals, as well as editorials and regular contributions from New Zealand Herald journalists.

Each article was uploaded to NVivo, a data management software system, to support data management and analysis. The 179 articles were analysed thematically, using a generative and inductive approach. While a number of articles addressed overlapping themes, an iterative process distilled them into three key areas: an over-riding emphasis on the economic contribution of migrants; the influence of migrants on Auckland's infrastructure, services and housing market; and fraud and exploitation, perpetrated both by and against immigrants.

Caveats and Limitations

The study is designed to provide some impressions of the topics considered in the media and how these issues are framed by authors. It is not intended to be exhaustive and has a number of limitations. The key limitation is that it focuses on New Zealand Herald articles only. Given many people consume their media using a range of digital media platforms this is somewhat problematic. The second limitation is that while the research identifies some of the dominant discourses underpinning articles on immigration and ethnic diversity, it is not able to shed light on how these articles are received by readers. Further investigation could be valuable for revealing audience perceptions.

Findings

The following section of this report presents the main findings from the research concerned with the way the NZ Herald framed stories about ethnic diversity and immigration in Tāmaki Makaurau, Auckland. The Government's changes to the skilled migration visa rules in April 2017 was announced during the one year period of the study and is therefore also included in the analysis. Three major themes were identified from the articles, these were: the economic benefit of migration; the burden or cost of immigration on infrastructure, services and housing; and fraud and exploitation.

Immigration Provides Economic Benefits for Auckland and New Zealand

A major theme identified from the Herald articles was around the economy and the economic benefits of immigration for Auckland and New Zealand more generally. Fifty-five articles (almost a third) made reference to either direct or indirect positive contributions to the economy, with many attributing immigration to economic growth. Figures from a report compiled by Business and Economic Research Ltd (BERL) for the Department of Labour in 2013 were quoted in several articles (e.g. Chaudhuri, 2017, 6 April). The report revealed the annual net contribution of \$2,912 million made by migrants to the national economy, which is higher than that for the local born, with an equivalent value of \$2653 per migrant compared to just \$172 per New Zealand-born person. These figures were used to highlight the relative economic benefit of migrants and to support the economic rationale for immigration. This portrayal of migrants as key stimuli for the economy was made by many industry leaders as well as by then Prime Minister, Bill English, who was reported as saying that the high number of migrants is a "good problem to have" as it indicated a healthy economy. Such statements create clear links between the 'booming economy' and immigration levels, as illustrated in the following:

'This is what it feels like to be in a growing economy with some confidence and some direction....The Government is focused on supporting that growth, not trying to shut it off.' (Davison, 2017, 27 February)

There were two distinct ways the economic benefits of immigration and diversity were articulated in the articles: first was through the key role immigrants play in filling major shortages in the New Zealand labour market; and second was through the entrepreneurialism of immigrants.

Immigrant Labour is Vital for the Economy

Immigration was frequently portrayed as vital for addressing the country's labour shortages. Many of the Herald's reporters emphasised the importance of migrants in key industries such as dairying, farming, horticulture, hospitality, aged care and construction. Reporters drew on comments from industry leaders and spokespersons who expressed their concerns about the difficulties they experienced in meeting labour demands and thus the need to employ workers from overseas. For instance, an opinion piece from prominent Auckland immigration lawyer, Alistair McClymont (2016, 6 July) revealed the difficulty that employers faced in trying to meet the labour needs from the local population where, according to the employers he had spoken to, more than 90 percent of job applications came from migrants. Other reporters such as Simon Collins (2016, 19 October) also supported such claims, quoting spokespersons and executives in the hospitality, farming and aged-care industries and their concerns over the lack of 'Kiwi' workers available despite concerted efforts and agendas to prioritise and incentivise them. These articles suggest that the difficulty in filling the jobs with local workers is because of some reluctance and unwillingness from native-born New Zealanders to train and work in these key industries.

Articles by business editor, Liam Dann (2016, 22 August), and property editor, Anne Gibson (2016, 8 July) also highlighted similar issues in the building industry. Both reporters repeatedly pointed out the

urgent need for skilled tradespeople for Auckland's 'construction boom' and the Christchurch rebuild. Drawing on statements from Graham Darlow, Chief Executive of New Zealand's leading construction company, Fletcher Construction Ltd., Gibson highlighted the company's 'recruitment hunt' in London to fill labour shortages in Auckland's upcoming building and infrastructure construction surge. Hawkins construction company boss, Geoff Hunt, is quoted in another article (Theunissen, 2016, 3 November) saying that the industry is 'crying out for skilled workers' and that the demand could not be met by training alone:

'In order to make sure we meet the construction sector demand we are going to have to bring in people from offshore. We can't train our way out of it and we will need to continue to use immigration to fill skill-gaps to meet all the work we have coming up.'

Against the backdrop of a booming economy, and a seemingly insufficient number of local workers available, the articles portray immigrants as vital to help maintain the growth of the nation's key industries.

The discourse that immigration is an important tool for addressing labour shortages counters populist ideas of migrants 'stealing' jobs from young New Zealanders – a popularised view that was reinforced in a Salvation Army report on youth unemployment released in October 2016. The author, Alan Johnson (2016), a social policy analyst for the Salvation Army suggested that the 'explosion' of the number of immigrants is 'crowding out' more marginalised workers in the labour market. However, numerous articles countered this position, citing suggestions made by employers and the Government that local workers are to blame for the nation's reliance on migrant labour. McClymont's (2016, July) opinion piece highlighted, for example, the range of people that are included in the net migration figures and their different pathways and also indicated that employers tended to prefer migrants because of their better work ethic over the 'casual Kiwi attitude'. Native-born workers were reported as taking more sick days, while migrants were framed as more highly motivated and driven to succeed in their jobs. In a similar vein, political reporter, Isaac Davison (2017, 27 February), reported on then Prime Minister Bill English's accusation that unemployed young people in New Zealand were not able to fill labour shortages because many were failing to pass workplace drug tests. According to English, this constitutes a key reason for maintaining high immigration numbers rather than reducing them.

Highlighting the political and contested nature of immigration debates, Davison's follow-up article the next day (2017, 28 February) provided a counter point to the suggestions made by English. In his article 'Just 466 failed drug tests since 2013, Ministry of Social Development says', Davison cited figures from the Ministry of Social Development (MSD) of the actual number of failed pre-employment drug tests recorded since the tests were implemented three years ago. The figures indicated a relatively low number of 'Kiwi' job seekers failing the drug tests. Trade Union representatives as well as then Opposition party spokespersons were also quoted in the article accusing English of exaggerating the drug issue to justify not curbing immigration numbers. Taken together, these Herald articles recognise and emphasise the importance of immigrants for the country's economy.

While the majority of the articles discussing the economic contributions of immigrants focused on the lower paid sectors, a quarter referred to the need for 'skilled' and 'talented' migrants for business innovation in middle-class occupations. Immigrants were portrayed as possessing the valuable skills and talent that was missing in the local population, critical given that the 2016 Auckland Chamber of Commerce Business Update survey revealed that 48 per cent of respondents reported having difficulty finding the talent they required for their businesses to grow and prosper (Auckland Chamber of Commerce, 2016). The need for skilled talented migrants is echoed in other articles emphasising the benefits that ethnic diversity has for businesses (discussed later). Immigration is therefore framed as

necessary, not only due to labour shortages but also because of the unique skills and abilities that migrants are thought to contribute to businesses. Both justifications are underpinned by an economic imperative.

The economic imperative of immigration was also notable in several articles discussing the government's changes to the skilled migration requirements, which were announced 19 April 2017. One of the major changes was the requirement that skilled migrants meet the new income threshold set at the national medium of \$49,000 to be eligible to apply for residency. Those who do not meet the threshold would be given a maximum three-year visa, after which they would have a one-year stand down period before any other visa could be approved. Then Immigration Minister, Michael Woodhouse, explained the changes as attempts to increase the 'quality' of migrants rather than reducing the numbers. Of the more than 25 Herald articles covering the issue immediately following the announcements, almost three-quarters reported on the concerns from industry leaders and spokespersons. Coverage was highest during April and May 2017 with many reporting the negative impact the changes would have on their business and growth. Concerns were mainly from the hospitality and tourism sector as average salaries for staff rarely met the new median income threshold. Restaurant owners and industry experts argued that migrants were vital to the industry as few New Zealanders considered a long-term career in hospitality and that increasing employees' wages to meet the criteria would mean significant increases would be passed on to consumers. In an article by Lincoln Tan (2017, 27 April), Restaurant Association Chief Executive, Marisa Bidois, warned that:

'The restaurant industry will be hard hit because it is an extremely people-focused industry, and we rely on labour and cannot rely on technology.'

She highlighted that many restaurants were reliant on migrant workers and that there were 'simply not enough Kiwis to fill the gaps.' The immigration changes would therefore have a 'significant impact on the industry.' Such concerns were also echoed in a repeatedly cited (e.g. Dann, 2017) statement made by Massey University's migration expert, Paul Spoonley, who warned that the changes would have 'a huge impact on the hospitality industry.'

Similar concerns about the impact of the changes on business bottom-lines and industry growth were also raised by those in aged-care, trucking and farming. Due to the lack of 'Kiwis' available to fill labour shortages in these key industries, appeals from spokespersons tended to highlight the negative economic impact of the proposed changes. However, the sole focus on economic impact constructs migrants as purely labour resources. In a May 2017 article (NZ Herald - The Country, 2017), Andrew Hoggard, national board member of Federated Farmers, was quoted as saying he was pleased that:

'... within the suite of changes announced by Immigration Minister Michael Woodhouse today, farmers, especially in the dairy industry, will continue to have access to migrant workers in situations where there are insufficient New Zealanders available to fill vacancies.'

Hoggard's statement suggests that immigration is about the employers' ability to access resources if and when required, rather than about migrants as human beings working *and living* in the country. His concern about the prospect of migrants having to leave after three years further reinforces this view:

'I'm concerned about the prospect of a migrant being forced to leave after three years, after they have worked hard to develop a core set of skills, just for the farmer to have to employ another migrant because there are no New Zealanders available.'

The concern here is focused on losing all the skills that are necessary to effectively do the jobs – skills that migrants would have acquired over the three years of working. That the focus is on farmers losing skills further reinforces the view of migrants as economic resources whose right to stay in a country is measured on their utility for business. This utilitarian framing of migrants was notable in various articles, including, for example, reporter Heather du Plessis-Allan's (2017, 23 April) article weighing in on the discussions about immigration and housing. While she did not argue that immigration numbers should be cut she did express that, 'I think we need their skills and their money. But we also need to be picky about which ones we take.' Her suggestion to be 'picky' resonates with the Immigration Minister's reference to 'quality' migrants who are, in other words, those who earn more. Quoted in several articles, Woodhouse described the changes as an attempt to 'get the right balance':

'A balance between ensuring employers can meet genuine labour shortages by using people from overseas, while at the same time ensuring those lower skilled migrants are coming here with a clear understanding of their visa conditions.'

Again, the focus is on the interests of employers and their ability to access required labour. These changes to visa conditions reinforces the economic utility of migrants and effectively punishes those lower-skilled migrants whose economic contribution is not as immediately evident. Given the status and authority of those being cited in these articles, and the paucity of comments from either industry leaders or the Government concerned with the impact on the lives of migrants and their families, the dominant discourses normalise a view of immigration as solely about economics, with little regard for new inequalities that result.

The utilitarian view of immigrants dominated media discourses and only approximately one-quarter of the articles took into consideration the impact of the skilled migrant visa changes on migrants and their future security in New Zealand. NZ Herald Business Editor Liam Dann's (2017, 30 April) article 'Let's lead the world on immigration debate', for instance, encouraged New Zealanders to, amongst other things, consider the lives of migrants when discussing immigration:

'We could be respectful of individuals, recognising when we discuss immigration policy we are talking issues that have an enormous impact on families with hopes and aspirations and rights.'

Other articles incorporated the voices of migrants. An article released the day after the visa changes were announced, titled 'Immigration changes: How it will affect workers: Michael Woodhouse touts benefits' (NZ Herald, 2017, 20 April), began by drawing on the experience of a 22 year old migrant from Hong Kong. The young migrant, who had been living in New Zealand for five years and had completed a Bachelor in International Hospitality Management from AUT, expressed concern about the changes and how they would make it impossible for her to continue working in her current restaurant job. The article went on to note that more than two in five migrants would be impacted by the visa rule changes as their salaries did not meet the new income thresholds, while also articulating the changes and the Government's rationale for them. Another article by Lincoln Tan (2017, 4 May), a senior reporter on diversity, ethnic affairs and immigration for the NZ Herald, reported on the 'betrayal' that a travel consultant from the Czech Republic felt after the announced visa rule changes. Two other articles included brief comments by an employer (Tan, 2017, 24 May) and an immigration advisor respectively (Tan, 2017, 27 April) on the unfairness of the changes for migrants and the struggles they already faced. Though these articles did not disrupt or challenge the dominant economic rhetoric, they did offer another perspective, acknowledging the lives of those who are at the centre of debates about immigration and whose voices have, for the most part, been unheard. As

such, these articles provided a more holistic view of immigrants as human beings who work *and* live in the country, and have a right to do so.

Entrepreneurial Immigrants are Welcome and Celebrated

The economic value of immigrants was further emphasised in reports of successful entrepreneurial activities of migrants. These underlined either the benefit of migrant businesses or the related advantage of diversity that immigrants bring. Numerous references were made to immigrants being small business owners, with at least five articles reporting on the success of different migrant business endeavours. Stories included, for example, culturally-specific enterprises launched by migrants such as the award-winning Indian restaurant Cassia (Nichol, 2017, 1 May); and Radio Tarana (NZ Herald, 2017, 5 June), a successful radio brand for Auckland's Indian and Hindu speaking communities; as well as other multi-million dollar businesses (NZ Herald, 2016, 4 December). Reporting on the success of the Magic Group Ltd., Lincoln Tan (2016, 9 October) expressly drew attention to the two business owners' background as former international students from China:

'A former student who came to New Zealand speaking little English has turned the business he started in his garage into a \$15 million operation. Kai Du came to Auckland from Inner Mongolia, China, as an international student at age 24 in 2008. He studied business, and through a common love for computers with his then roommate Johnny Zhang, also from China, they started Magic Group Ltd.'

Tan frames their success as examples of what can happen when a new migrant combines hard work with innovation and enterprise, including leveraging existing relationships with their homeland, and a willingness to take a risk. On the one hand, Tan's article, along with the other success stories of immigrants in Auckland covered in the Herald (e.g. Nichol, 2017, 1 May; NZ Herald, 2017, 13 February), emphasises the positive contributions migrants make to the economy. On the other hand, however, championing their success in this way also inadvertently reduces their contribution to economic factors while failing to account for other contributions made by migrants.

Other articles also countered the view of migrants competing with 'Kiwis' for scarce jobs. Tan (2017, 31 January), for instance, directly addressed the question by asking experts for their opinions. Respondents, Rachel Hodder and Jason Krupp, authors of the 2017 report 'The New New Zealanders - Why Migrants Make Good Kiwis' both rejected the notion and insisted instead on migrants' positive contribution in creating jobs through entrepreneurial activities. In their original report, they cited Treasury figures indicating the \$5 billion investment that business investor migrants have contributed to the economy since 2009. These figures were cited in a number of NZ Herald articles (e.g. Tan, 2017, 30 January). Business Professor Ananish Chaudhuri's opinion piece (2017, 6 April) also highlighted the fact that the number of jobs in the country increased with the number of immigrants. Reporting on successful migrant businesses, drawing on the opinions of experts and including empirical evidence from trusted sources emphasised the positive economic contributions that immigrants make and implies greater benefits to wider society.

Reporting on the success of migrant businesses also drew on the notion of population diversity itself as an economic asset to be exploited. This included being able to offer culturally distinct products and services to the market as well as possessing specific skills and knowledge that helped build economically beneficial relationships. The benefits of an ethnically diverse population were regularly talked about by the indigenous and migrant women interviewed for the launch of the 'Super Diverse Women' organisation (NZ Herald, 2017, 13 February), which was covered by the NZ Herald in February 2017 (e.g. NZ Herald, 2017, 16 February; Tan, 2017, 14 February). Though many of the interviewees acknowledged the biases and subtle forms of racism and discrimination they experienced in New

Zealand, when asked about the benefits that society garners from greater gender and ethnic diversity, their responses more often alluded to economic ones. Tan's (2017, 14 February) coverage of an interview with former refugee and lawyer, Rez Gardi, is illustrative. Gardi insists that:

'Excluding half of your population axiomatically means lower economic progress. By giving girls and women more potential to learn we can deliver stronger economies; by giving girls and women more opportunities, we can deliver better solutions.

Investment in gender and ethnic diversity powers progress for all. Gender and ethnic diversity allows for diverse, different and broader perspectives, ideas and solutions. We all have something different to bring to the table and our identity shapes and influences the way we see the world and the way we approach problems.'

Other articles also supported the economic rationale for diversity. For example, an article titled 'Employers benefit from diverse workforce' (NZ Herald, 2017, 15 February) and quoting Diversity Works then New Zealand chief executive Bev Cassidy-MacKenzie, discussed the way that businesses are 'taking advantage of what they already have' and that businesses that failed to do so, 'risked missing out from the competitive advantage.' Some articles were subtler in their emphasis on the benefits of ethnic and cultural diversity, but the economic discourse was nevertheless present. In Nichol's (2017, 1 May) coverage of Metro magazine's Restaurant of the Year 2017 awards, for instance, Sid and Chand Sahrawat (the owners of the Indian restaurant Cassia and winners of the best restaurant in Auckland award) explained how:

'Cassia was a way for the Sahrawats to explore their culinary heritage, and show Auckland's diners there was more to the subcontinent's cuisine than curry.'

Again, given the success of their restaurant, this reinforces messages around the benefits that ethnic and cultural diversity can have for business and the way in which culture can be transformed into an entrepreneurial activity.

In a similar way, while the celebration of ethnic holidays such as Diwali, Chinese New Year, and Eid, amongst others, was reported as recognising and celebrating these cultures and contributing to communities, some articles also talked about holidays and associated festivals in terms of their economic benefits. Auckland Council Environment and Community Committee Chair, Penny Hulse, for instance, was quoted praising the Chinese New Year and the annual Lantern Festival as it helped to 'deliver social and economic benefits, as well as added to Auckland's cultural vibrancy' (Tan, 2017, 8 February). In another article, Tan (2017, 27 January) also highlighted the 'boom' to the tourism industry expected from Chinese New Year with more than '33,000 Chinese holidaymakers from China anticipated to arrive for the lunar celebration':

'They [the Chinese tourists] are traditionally big spenders, with an average spend of \$5000 per head, which means they could potentially inject more than \$160 million into the economy.'

Other articles by Tan (e.g. 2016, 9 October; 2017, 27 January; 2017, 30 January) also emphasised the economic benefits of New Zealand's connection with Asia, drawing on a range of experts insisting on the need for New Zealanders to 'get to know migrant communities better', develop better connections, and increase their knowledge of Asia (Tan, 2017b, 16 March). Market researcher, Eric Chuah, for instance, was quoted saying that the financial power of Asians is '15 times of those New Zealand born, and would be an attractive segment of customers' (Tan, 2017b, 16 March). While promoting the benefits of ethnic diversity to Auckland, and New Zealand more broadly, the approach

taken by Tan reinforces the economic value of migrants and framed migrants as economic resources and consumers. Although such an economic framing is not in and of itself negative, there is a risk that such a narrow focus neglects any humanitarian considerations of migration and settlement, including the rights of migrants who choose to come here.

Numerous statements by immigrant business owners reinforced the economic imperative, emphasising their own particular cultural and linguistic skills and knowledge as a beneficial attribute for business. However, an opinion piece submitted by a Chinese migrant real estate agent (NZ Herald, 2016, 14 August) accused Auckland of becoming 'too much like China' where, instead of having a 'balanced ethnic mix', Auckland had started to develop an 'unwholesomely Chinese flavour' with Chinese 'supplement shops, internet cafes and restaurants' along with 'poorly designed, cheap signs written only in Chinese at every corner.' In his view, this was evidence of Auckland allowing in too many 'low quality' immigrants. He asked readers, rhetorically, what they wanted Auckland and New Zealand to be:

'Do we want trained, skilled professionals to bring our economy to the next level or all we want to see is another Chinese restaurant around the corner, or foreign visitors mistaking Auckland for China?'

Again, a distinction is made about what skills and resources are considered desirable. In his view, 'low quality' migrants who open ethnic restaurants are not desirable. Instead, they are considered merely visual blights in Auckland's urban landscape instead of businesses that contribute to the economy. He also, of course, assumes the two are mutually exclusive. The assumed dichotomy suggests that migrants who help 'take the economy to the next level' must do so without changing the look and feel of Auckland. The implication that ethnic shop owners are 'low quality' immigrants reinforces the seemingly dominant view that what validates one as a 'quality migrant', and thus deserving of migration and settlement in New Zealand, is one's ability to, above all else, make significant contributions to the economy.

Summary

It is evident from the analysis that the economic imperative of immigration is a pervasive discourse in the NZ Herald articles. As we have highlighted, immigrants are seen as important and necessary sources of labour for the nation's key industries and as successful entrepreneurs and business owners who contribute directly and indirectly to the economy. The overriding justification for the presence of immigrants is therefore their capacity to contribute economically, as reflected in the articles. This dominant discourse is reiterated not only by the New Zealand-born population, but has also been internalised and reinforced by migrants themselves who emphasise the unique set of skills and knowledge migrants add to businesses for a competitive edge. These discourses put great emphasis on the economic utility of immigrants and risks portraying them as solely economic resources. Not only are the perspectives and voices of immigrants relatively limited in the articles, the unbalanced reporting on the views and concerns of the Government and industry leaders, who occupy relative positions of authority compared to individual immigrants, reinforces the utilitarian view. As a consequence, the dominant economic discourse marginalises the concerns of immigrants living in New Zealand and portrays them as resources and assets for the growth of the economy.

The 'Burden' of Immigration on Infrastructure, Services and Housing

The second major theme identified in the NZ Herald articles on immigration and ethnic diversity was on infrastructure, services and housing in Auckland, with more than 40 articles making some reference to these issues. Though economic benefits legitimised the high levels of immigration and helped cast it in a positive light, there were major concerns expressed in the articles about the impacts high immigration had on Auckland's infrastructure, roads, schools, healthcare and housing market.

Claims that Immigration Puts Undue Pressure on Infrastructure and Services

Almost two thirds of the articles referred to the pressures of immigration on infrastructure and roads, including worsening traffic congestion and the lack of affordable housing (the latter discussed in the following section). The 'rampant growth' (Orsman, 2017, 9 April) of Auckland was frequently talked about as unsustainable and in need of being better planned. The metaphors used by reporters to describe the situation included descriptions of the city 'swelling' (Gray, 2017, 1 February), 'bursting at the seams' (Higgins, 2017, 20 April), with 'creaking infrastructure' (Hisco, 2016, 20 July), 'creaking at the seams' (NZ Herald, 2017, 8 April), roads that are 'choked' (Higgins, 2017, 20 April), as well as the city 'sinking' (Orsman, 2017, 9 April), under extreme population size pressures. Then Labour leader, Andrew Little, was also quoted in a number of articles describing Auckland as being 'packed to the gunnels' (e.g. Jones, 2017, 20 April). All these metaphors conjured images of the city being at maximum capacity and on the verge of total collapse, due, supposedly, to the number of immigrants settling in the city.

Notably, the majority (80 percent) of the articles that referred directly to the relationship between immigration and pressures on infrastructure used terms other than 'immigrants' or 'migrants' to attribute responsibility. Reporters and the experts they cited used terms such as 'net migration', 'immigration figures', 'immigration policy', 'record migration', 'immigration' and 'high migration' to talk about these issues. This rhetorical strategy ostensibly avoids assigning blame to immigrants themselves and rather highlights immigration policy as the problem, as explicitly pointed out by Liam Dann (2017, 30 April):

'Immigration policy of the past decade is not sustainable. Our infrastructure is under pressure and we are woefully behind in building to catch up. That's not the fault of immigrants, of course. It is the fault of politicians and voters.'

That said, although focusing on immigration policy may help to rhetorically shelter immigrants from blame, the discussions are, nevertheless, still about immigrants – as individuals and their ability to live and work, or not, in the city. Not discussing the issues specifically in relation to immigrants has the unintended consequence of obfuscating the real life impact the changes to the skilled migrant visa rules, in particular, would have on the basic needs and desires of migrants as individuals.

From the few articles that did refer to immigrants when discussing the added pressures on infrastructure and services, it is evident that the dehumanised economic framing of immigrants influenced public perceptions and opinions. Super City reporter, Bernard Orsman (2017, 9 April) cited comments from a number of NZ Herald readers in his article titled 'Labour party promises to cut immigration', highlighting how the announcement by Labour came after widespread concerns from the public about the impact of immigration on the city. One reader is quoted as saying 'Stop letting people in. We are sinking', while another reader, Don Conway, made the comment that:

'120,000 new residents was too many. It was okay for returning New Zealanders, but the others are clogging infrastructure - schooling, health, facilities etc.' According to this reader, while it is okay for returning New Zealanders to add to the population in Auckland, it is not okay for the immigrant 'others' to do so as they simply 'clog' the city's infrastructure and services. Considering these views in conjunction with the dominant economic rhetoric, it implies that while the contributions of immigrants to the economy and society are welcomed, their basic needs for services and resources are not. Instead, these needs are constructed as problematic not only for the city but also for Government. This view may be read in Liam Dann's (2017, 30 January) article 'Should migrants pay for infrastructure costs?' in which he discussed the recommendations made by the authors of the 'The New New Zealanders - Why Migrants Make Good Kiwis' report to charge migrants a levy to help the Government fund infrastructure developments. While the authors of the report warn against blaming immigrants for rising house prices, they concede that high levels of migration have increased pressures on the need to fund more roads, schools and hospitals. The authors note:

'No research seems to have been conducted at a local level on whether the financial contribution of migrants sufficiently offsets the costs it imposes on local jurisdictions in the long run.' (Hodder & Krupp, 2017, p. 29)

Clearly, this cost-benefit analysis contributes to the reduction of immigrants to merely economic objects. That their basic needs such as a home, health care, education and roads are seen as a 'cost' and added pressure on the 'already stretched' infrastructure implies that immigrants must not be a physical or financial burden on the city and society.

This way of framing the contribution of migrants as purely economic notably dominated media discourses but a minority of articles did take issue with this seemingly taken-for-granted view. Perhaps the most substantive challenges to the discourse were expressed in two opinion pieces by self-identified migrants, who clearly highlighted the failure to acknowledge and respect migrants as full human beings. In a piece titled 'Why are so many New Zealanders so scared of immigrants?' Laura Kneer (2017, 20 April), a German migrant working in the media industry, acknowledged that her positive experience of immigrating is not necessarily the reality for other immigrants who are more likely to encounter discrimination and racism. In warning against the rise of xenophobia in political debates about immigration, she stressed the shared humanity of immigrants:

'Immigrants too want to be able to afford their own home. We hate being stuck in traffic, or waiting on hospital lists because budgets haven't appropriately been adjusted to the amount of people they cater for. We are worried about the quality of our water and air as much as you are.'

Rather than exclusively talking about migrants as workers and contributors to the economy, the author emphasised that migrants have the same desires and needs as the local population, many of whom have publicly voiced their concerns.

Deborah Hill Cone, a columnist for the NZ Herald, also rejected the uncritically accepted commodification of immigrants (2017, 24 April). In her article 'On immigration we're looking in the wrong queue', Cone, who migrated to New Zealand with her family at the age of eight from South Africa directly challenged the normalised framing of immigrants as either the cause or the solution to the country's economic woes:

'Our economy seems to function largely through the import of people. This notion, that immigration is a valid instrument of growth, seems to have become so accepted that it doesn't even get questioned much. So when Immigration Minister Michael Woodhouse said last week the new immigration policies announced are about

"attracting migrants who bring the most economic benefits to New Zealand" no one bats an eyelid. It is a given. We are just bringing in a better quality commodity. Ahem, these are human beings, not merely an apparatus to use to boost our GDP.

Immigration is not the cause of our economic woes ... But immigrants are not the solution, either. Immigrants are people, like my family, who are would-be citizens, who want to make a life for themselves, human beings, not economic levers.'

Though significantly outnumbered, both these opinion pieces inserted into media discussions about immigrants and their impact on infrastructure and resources, the human dimension of migrants. In doing so, they provided the most explicit assertion – and reminder – of the humanity of immigrants amongst an otherwise relatively complicit acceptance of the economic justification that dominates in the articles.

Claims that Immigration Places Undue Pressure on the Housing Market

Another major concern frequently voiced in the media was the impact of immigration on housing prices and availability in Auckland. At least 80 percent of the articles reinforced the view that Auckland's inflated house prices were a result of high immigration numbers. None of the articles provided empirical evidence to support their claims, instead asserting the position as fact, as evident in the following two excerpts:

'This country is already in the grip of a record immigration boom - nominally outstripping any time in our history, dating back to 1860. This has already been highlighted as one cause for the dramatic surge in house prices.' (Dann, 2016, 22 August)

'New Zealand has imposed tougher criteria for skilled migrants and cracked down on applications for student visas over increased concerns about the level of immigration. At the same time, the government has extolled the benefits of immigration, with a swelling population stoking more activity and record inflows of tourists underpinning an economy growing at a rapid pace. At the same time, a rising population has posed problems for policymakers by fuelling demand for an already-stretched housing market in Auckland, while restraining wage growth.' (NZ Herald, 2017, 31 January)

A study by economists Bill Cochrane and Jacques Poot (2016), which found no conclusive evidence that supported the assertion that high immigration is pushing up house prices, was cited in at least three articles but this empirical research did not appear to destabilise the prevailing discourse. Of the more than 30 articles that made some reference to the issue, only approximately one quarter highlighted the multifaceted nature of Auckland's rapidly increasing house prices. These articles emphasised 'low interest rates, investor demand, capital gains expectations and New Zealanders returning from overseas' (Davison, 2016, 10 August) as the main drivers for the inflated house prices instead of immigration, pointing to the fact that net migration numbers are predominantly made up of student and temporary migrants who are more likely to rent than buy property. Because of this, the articles insisted that immigration is only a very small contributor to the issue in the context of more significant factors.

The debate about immigration's impact on housing is also a political one and the inclusion of quotes from key politicians helped to normalise the assumption that immigration is pushing up house prices. Numerous articles cited statements from members of key political parties, particularly then Labour opposition, insisting on the need for changes to immigration to reduce the pressures on housing and infrastructure (e.g. Gibson, 2016, 30 November). In response to the Government rejecting the notion

of curbing immigration to ease the supposed pressure on housing in Auckland, then Labour Party housing spokesperson Phil Twyford was cited as saying:

'... immigration is putting pressure on housing and the labour market. The Government should throw off the ideological blinkers and review the immigration policy.' (Gibson, 2016, 30 November)

Similarly, in other articles, Phil Goff was quoted, saying:

'Urgent and bold action is needed to stop the worsening housing crisis and restore the affordability and availability of housing.' (Orsman, 2016, 28 August)

'Immigration is good for New Zealand but we need to ease the level down until housing and transport infrastructure catches up with the growth, or we will end up with worsening congestion and even less affordable housing.' (Jones, 2016, 15 August)

The relative authority of politicians and the power of their discourses help validate and normalise the view that immigration is the cause of rising house prices, particularly in the absence of any conclusive findings to corroborate it. And, like the discursive framing of immigration in relation to infrastructure and services in Auckland, the statements cited in the articles also demonstrate a similar abstraction where the housing issues are discussed in relation to the process, policy and practice rather than in direct relation to the people, that is, immigrants and their need for shelter and housing.

Though the discourse of *immigration* causing rising house prices puts the focus on policy rather than people, a handful of articles during the one year period of the study explicitly discussed the issues of housing in relation to a particular migrant community. These articles reinforced earlier concerns and discourses of Chinese investors buying Auckland property. This included, for example, an article in July 2016 that reported on the move by Ray White Real Estate to link up with a major real estate agency in China to list properties for sale in New Zealand (Gibson, 2016, 26 July); Vaimoana Tapaleao's article in October 2016 which highlighted how real-estate agents have been urging property owners in Auckland to sell up due to the 'looming decline in cashed-up Asian property buyers' (Tapaleao, 2016, 27 October); and an opinion piece by an anonymous Chinese real estate agent who expressed his or her concerns about the role that Chinese immigrants play in Auckland's housing issue (NZ Herald (2016, 14 August). All these articles make direct associations between investment in housing and the Chinese community, in effect, assigning blame to the Chinese for the housing problems in the city. An excerpt from the opinion piece submitted by the anonymous Chinese real-estate agent is instructive:

'I remember seeing young couples with their hands clenched and eyes glued to the auction screen, only to find their first dream house outbid by someone screaming in Mandarin. And I shudder to imagine their feeling when they see the very house they missed out back on the market within a couple of months, this time, with 200k added on top ... meanwhile, a champagne is uncorked at another New Zealand property expo in China.'

There are a number of concerns here. First, the agent assumes that Mandarin speakers are foreigners and not New Zealand residents or citizens. Second, the agent's reference to a property expo in China implies that these buyers are investors and not simply purchasing a property as their own home. Finally, the agent fails to acknowledge that investment in housing is not only the domain of those who identify as Chinese; those born locally also buy investment properties with no interrogation of their motivations. That said, the fact that this anecdotal evidence is from a real-estate agent claiming to

have 'inside knowledge' adds greater weight to his claims about Chinese investors and contributes to dominant discourses around locally born New Zealanders being priced out of the housing market.

Summary

In the articles analysed over the one year period of the study, the framing of immigration in relation to infrastructure, services and housing in Auckland has contributed to the dehumanisation of immigrants. As we have seen, the dominant discourses portray 'high immigration' as the source of issues around the city's traffic congestion, the inadequate provision of health care and schools, and the inflated house prices that are unaffordable for so-called 'everyday Kiwis'. Discussing the city's problems in relation to immigration policy may help mitigate against accusations of blatant discrimination against certain groups of people, but the abstraction nevertheless implies that immigrants are taking up scarce resources and 'burdening' the city. Importantly, the discourse also denies immigrants their fundamental humanity and multidimensional needs. An understanding of immigrants' need for a home to live in as well as to have their other basic needs, such as transport, health care and education for the children, met, is entirely absent in the articles. Considering this in conjunction with the economic imperative normalised in the articles, it again constructs and reduces immigrants to merely economic objects whose utility should be maximised for the benefit of the country.

Fraud and Exploitation

Criminal activities was another major theme identified in the articles on immigration and ethnic diversity in the NZ Herald, with more than 50 articles in the one year period reporting on stories of crime. The articles included a range of criminal offences such as money laundering, drug smuggling, deception, cases of domestic violence, and sexual assault, but the most frequent were cases of immigration fraud and the exploitation of migrant workers which accounted for more than three quarters of the articles. Due to the significance and severity of some cases they were reported on multiple times in different articles.

Immigration Fraud is a Serious Problem for Auckland

A number of incidences of immigration fraud were reported on. A small number of these were cases of individuals submitting false passports to either enter or remain in the country, while others involved significant numbers of people. The case of Filipino mother, Loraine Jayme, charged with committing 284 acts of immigration fraud is one example, which was reported on numerous times in the Herald (e.g. Feek, 2017a, 4 April; Feek, 2017b, 4 April). The articles reported on how Jayme had helped more than 100 people migrate from the Philippines to New Zealand with false employment offers and CVs, charging each person more than \$2000 to do so. Articles dated back as early as February 2016, but the article by Belinda Feek (2017b, 4 April) entitled 'How immigration fraudster Loraine Jayme got 17 migrants to NZ on fake jobs' was the most detailed and gave the perspective from the convicted migrant's point of view. According to Jayme, her intention was to 'help' the other Filipinos who had contacted her for advice on how to migrate to New Zealand. However, as Feek noted, Peter Devoy, Immigration NZ's assistant general manager, accused Jayme of 'systematically ripping off vulnerable migrants' and said the department did not believe the offending was limited to just 17 applicants. He also stated that the 'victims weren't so much the 17 Filipinos who have since continued to live successfully in New Zealand, rather everyday Kiwis.' He said:

'The situation from our point of view is that the victim here is very much the New Zealand citizen. It's the systems that Immigration have in place to protect New Zealand, to protect the border, which have been the subject of the offending more so than the 17 victims named in the case.'

It is interesting to note Devoy's primary concern is with the so-called victimisation of New Zealand citizens, rather than those migrants who were duped by Jayme, somewhat surprising given his role with Immigration NZ.

Most cases of immigration fraud reported over the one year period had taken place in the international education industry. The reports of fraud were often contextualised within the Government's agenda to maintain the international education sector as one of New Zealand's biggest export industries, with its plan to increase the annual revenue from international students to \$5 billion by 2025 (e.g. Laxon, 2016, 5 December). Articles included statements by politicians and union leaders as well as accounts by the students themselves with most placing the blame and responsibility for fraudulent actions on the Government (e.g. Laxon, 2016, 5 December). Key members of political parties, particularly the (then) Opposition and NZ First were frequently quoted in the articles criticising the Government's handling of fraud cases and their lack of regulation around the international education market and student immigration. Winston Peters, for instance, was cited blaming the prioritisation of profit by the Government:

'This is what happens when Mr Joyce and the government pump up a business so private enterprise can profit but there are no standards; no tight rules or regulations

just an open end industry to get as many students here as possible.' (Hill, 2016, 3 September)

Other parties involved in fraud cases were also highlighted, including the private training establishments (PTE), international education agents, and Indian students who made up the largest cohort of international students. A number of articles focused on the PTEs catering specifically for international students and reported on the number of institutions being shut down after inspection from the NZ Qualifications Authority (NZQA). These typically involved cases of systemic plagiarism and cheating on behalf of the students (Laxon, 2016, 6 December), although the role of institutions in cheating was also discussed, including the case of the now defunct New Zealand International Academy who declared they were asked to prepare fake results for more than 250 English language tests (Laxon, 2016, 5 December).

The role of education agents was also highlighted in some of the articles. The most widely reported case of fraud in the international education sector involved twelve students from India who faced deportation due to fraudulent bank statements submitted to Immigration New Zealand by their education agents (e.g. Collins, 2016, 2 October; Collins, 2017, 3 February). Articles covering the incident first emerged in late 2016 when the fraudulent documents were uncovered by Immigration NZ. As the students faced deportation, media reports covered the range of arguments that were made in support of the students (e.g. NZ Herald, 2017, 6 February; Chaudhuri, 2017, 15 February) with the specific cases seen as part of a larger education sector issue involving the fraudulent activity of education agents in India. News Editor, Andrew Laxon's (2016, 5 December) article highlighted the extent of the problem:

'An investigation in March by Immigration New Zealand's Mumbai office, which processes all student visas from Indian nationals, found "significant, organised financial document fraud" by agents in the southern city of Hyderabad. The fraud involved a bank loan letter (originally genuine) showing a student had access to funds to pay school fees, which was used fraudulently for other student applications.

The investigation identified 57 agents and 15 corrupt bank branch managers using the scam, which was described in emails as "a significant threat to NZ's education integrity" with possible links to organised crime. Five out of India's 10 biggest agents to New Zealand were involved, three of them extensively, and the overall fraud rate was estimated at 29 per cent.'

The twelve students at the centre of the investigation reported on in the Herald were issued deportation notices and, when they refused to leave, were escorted by Immigration NZ officers and police. Many of the articles appeared in February 2017 when the nine students who had managed to avoid officers took refuge in the Unitarian Church in Ponsonby, pleading not to be deported (e.g. Collins, 2017a, 3 February; Collins, 2017, 6 February). Articles included statements from the students insisting they were the victims of fraud as well as statements by the students' lawyer, Alistair McClymont, who blamed the situation on the Government's primary focus on the income generated by the agents and the schools:

'We know that Immigration NZ has taken no action against the agents who have taken all the money. They have taken no action against the schools who have taken all this money.'

'They don't seem to have taken any action against the Immigration officers who allowed these people to come here without interviews.'

'Some of the agents who created fraudulent documents are NZ citizens and we know the Government has taken no action against them whatsoever, because this is all about the money.' (Collins, 2017, 15 February)

McClymont also asserted that Indian students are 'sold a pathway to residency rather than a qualification' by both the New Zealand Government and the education agents who prioritise economic benefits over the welfare of students:

'Education agents are exempt. The Government's argument is that if they are too strict on the agents, the same agents will send students to other countries and we miss out on their money.' (Collins, 2016, 2 October)

While media reports tended to highlight the structural issues in the international education sector that created the conditions for fraud, they also included counter arguments which placed the blame and responsibility on the students (e.g. Smalley, 2017, 16 February). Some reporters quoted the Tertiary Education Minister Steven Joyce who defended the legitimacy and robustness of the Government's policies (e.g. Laxon, 2017, 3 March). Education reporter Simon Collins' (2016, 2 October) article, 'Students target Indian MP to fight deportation', for instance, cited Joyce framing the fraud cases as an issue at the individual student level:

'The rules are there to protect them from hardship and exploitation and ensure their period of study in New Zealand is successful and enjoyable. Around 125,000 international students study in New Zealand each year and nearly all follow the rules.

The Government makes no apologies for taking action in circumstances where students are found to have obtained their student visa fraudulently.

All student visa applicants have to make a declaration that all the information they have supplied is correct. While they may get agents to advise them, it is the responsibility of the student to ensure the information they are providing is accurate.'

By highlighting the significant size of the international student population in New Zealand compared to the relatively small number who have committed fraud, Joyce shifts the focus away from the immigration system to the twelve students who he claims are responsible for purposefully defrauding the system. An opinion piece titled 'Indian students need to go', by the television and radio journalist and presenter, Rachel Smalley (2017, 16 February), expressed a similar view, assigning blame to the students. In the article, Smalley reflects on her and her South African husband's immigration experience from London and rejects the notion that the education agents are to blame. She argues instead that by knowingly signing fraudulent documents the students are fully responsible for committing the fraud:

'The students signed their visa applications and in doing so, they signed fraudulent documents filled out by their agents. They paid those agents in India to help them to apply for a New Zealand visa, and it is the agents - they say - who are at fault here.

Not so. It is they who are at fault and whether it's knowingly or unknowingly, the students have committed fraud.'

While these counter arguments were reported on, the dominant narrative in the Herald was on the systemic issue created by the Government's prioritisation of profit from the international education sector and the associated problems arising from the market.

International Students are Framed as Vulnerable to Exploitation

Cases of immigration fraud were often closely linked to issues of exploitation and the associated vulnerability for migrants. For example, NZ Herald (2017, 14 June) highlighted concerns about the exploitation of these students, pointing to concerns from Immigration NZ staff in India about the existence of an 'exploitation/facilitation triangle' which involved Indian education agents, NZ educational institutions, and 'Kiwi' employers who were 'all making money from Indian students'. Simon Collins' (2017, 14 June) article discussed the resultant vulnerabilities faced by exploited students, drawing attention to concerns from immigration officials about the number of Indian students in Auckland sleeping in cars and threatening self-harm because they were unable to make enough money to buy food and live off. He also quoted a 22 June 2016 email from Immigration NZ's Mumbai risk manager Justin Alves saying that 'massive' commissions charged by Indian agents were driving a 'low-quality/high-volume' approach to the Indian market.' He pointed to:

'An agent/school/high-risk NZ employer exploitation/facilitation triangle which has built up around this whole market, resulting from the fact that most [or almost all?] Indian students intend to settle in NZ.' (Collins, 2017, 14 June)

Shifting the focus and discourse from fraud to exploitation and vulnerability, these articles provided another view of the international education industry, one in which the students are the victims. This view was corroborated in a research report authored by University of Auckland's Associate Professor Christina Stringer (2016) about the exploitation of migrant workers in New Zealand. She found that the international education sector was one of the seven main industry sectors in which cases of fraud and exploitation were the highest.

Other cases of exploitation reported on in the articles often took place in hospitality and retail and typically involved employers paying their staff significantly less than the national minimum wage (e.g. Carville, 2016, 14 December; HBT, 2017, 24 March). Numerous articles described incidences of exploitation in well-established restaurants in Auckland, including the case of the large Masala restaurant chain charged not only with exploiting their staff, but also with tax evasion and money laundering (e.g. Hurley, 2017, 1 March; Nichols & Fletcher, 2016, 6 July; NZ Herald, 2017, 2 March). Lincoln Tan's (2016, 29 October) article, 'Masala restaurant boss Rupinder Singh Chahil sentenced over exploitation' described the plight of the migrant workers at the restaurant: 'one staff member, an Indian national, was made to work about 66 hours a week and was paid around \$3 an hour.' Long hours of work while receiving infrequent and/or very low wages in return was a common finding across the cases and workers were often exploited by employers who were co-nationals.

The Herald also reported on the 'first ever case of human trafficking in New Zealand', which was covered by investigative reporter Olivia Carville (2016, 15 December). In her article 'Guilty: First human trafficking convictions in New Zealand', Carville (2016, 15 September) provided details of how Faroz Ali, the 'mastermind' behind the 'elaborate trafficking scam', managed to 'entice and exploit fifteen Fijian workers in New Zealand', and the guilty ruling from the court following his trial. As Carville put it, the migrant workers were:

'... sold a dream: working in New Zealand and earning almost seven times their weekly wages in Fiji. But, upon arrival into Auckland the false promises quickly unravelled.'

In her later articles (2016, 14 December; 2016, 15 December), Carville summarised the sentencing of Ali, citing some of the victim impact statements that were heard in court. She also drew on the findings from Associate Professor Christina Stringer (2016) which revealed the concerning prevalence of exploitative practices in many of New Zealand's lower paid industries. According to Stringer's report,

the highest incidences of exploitation were identified in seven of the country's main industry sectors which rely heavily on a migrant workforce, work that is often low-skilled and, in some cases, seasonal. This included: construction, dairying, hospitality, horticulture and viticulture, fishing, international education (as discussed earlier) and prostitution. Again, as stated in her report, practices of exploitation included excessively long work hours; non-payment or significant underpayment of wages; lack of formal employment contracts; non-payment of holiday pay; deduction of taxes from wages that were not being paid to Inland Revenue; and degrading treatment of workers including verbal and physical abuse. In another NZ Herald article by Carville (2016, 14 December), the vulnerability of migrant workers and the need for greater intervention and regulation by the Government to protect these workers was stressed. Quoting Stringer (2016), Carville notes that:

'Many migrants tolerated the exploitation because of the power imbalance between them and their employers, they had limited options to go elsewhere and they had been deceived into thinking their job might lead to permanent residency.'

Similar concerns about the vulnerability of migrants in employment situations were made in other articles. Lincoln Tan's (2017b, 14 February) piece, 'Refugee and immigrant millennials in NZ struggling to get into high-paying jobs', for instance, drew on a study by AUT University Professor of Diversity Edwina Pio highlighting the difficulties and challenges refugees and immigrant millennials (RIM) experience in relation to work. Tan notes how RIMs are over-represented in low-paying positions in hospitality, construction and cleaning and are more exposed to exploitative situations. He quotes Pio in the study saying that refugee and migrant workers:

"... may also be perceived as low-hanging fruit ripe for exploitation by organisations focused on short-term quick profits who inhabit the grey areas of minimum wage with maximum servitude."

Thus, while migrants may be sources of labour for many of the nation's key industries, the articles above shine light on some of the experiences and realities for migrant workers and the concerning prevalence of exploitative practices towards them.

Summary

Fraud and exploitation, as the third major theme identified in the Herald articles, offers another perspective on the predominantly utilitarian view of immigrants identified in the two themes discussed earlier. As we have just highlighted, while immigrants themselves have been the culprits of some criminal activities, a much more complicated relationship exists. In the context of international education, student migrants have been negatively implicated in more systemic issues arising from the economic imperative of education migration where the desire to migrate to New Zealand has been stoked by agents, institutions and the Government promoting the pathway and opportunities. But the circumstances of student migrants, and other migrants working in lower paid industries, also make them particularly vulnerable to exploitation from those who financially benefit from them. Although, at times, the articles refer to the hardship faced by migrants and therefore challenge overly utilitarian framing of them, they remain centrally focused on migrants' labour and the over-riding concern is the New Zealand economy and 'local' citizens. Collectively, then, in reporting on the various forms of criminal activity involving immigrants this third theme simultaneously brings into light the utility of migrants and migrants' humanity in terms of their complex and unpredictable experiences.

Conclusion

This report has been concerned with the dominant discourses of immigration and ethnic diversity in NZ Herald articles between July 2016 and June 2017. We felt it important to understand the way these issues were being framed and discussed in the context of Auckland, New Zealand, especially in light of significant events such as Brexit and the Trump election that have resurrected debates about diversity and immigration on the international stage, but also given the influence that mainstream media has on moulding public perceptions (Happer & Philoa, 2013). What we found was a propensity to dehumanise and effectively reduce migrants to their economic utility. Overall, little regard was paid to migrants' rights to settle in the city and make a home for themselves.

In the first major theme, we highlighted how the emphasis on economic utility pervades many accounts of immigration and ethnic diversity. A considerable portion of the Herald articles constructed immigrants explicitly as vital economic resources in the form of labour and/or cultural capital. Politicians and industry leaders were frequently cited stressing the importance of migrants filling jobs in the nation's key industries. The need for migrants, as workers, is portrayed as imperative as industries struggle to find New Zealanders willing and able to do the work. But, as we highlighted, it is not just migrants' labour that is deemed desirable. The ethnic, cultural and linguistic diversity of migrants are also seen to provide unique skills, abilities and knowledges that are of value in global markets and cosmopolitan cities. Thus, as many critics have argued already, framing immigration in purely economic terms constructs immigrants as merely resources to be used for the benefit of the economy.

Yet, it is concern over the impact of immigration on infrastructure, resources and housing that we have argued denies immigrants their humanity in the mainstream media. Rather than explicit statements that dehumanise through attributing non-human metaphors to the other (Ba-Tar, 1989 in Smith, 2014), however, the process of dehumanisation we identified in the NZ Herald articles works in a much subtler manner by failing to acknowledge the subjectivity, agency and individuality of immigrants and their quintessentially human characteristics (LeMoncheck, 1985 in Smith, 2014), as well as identifying their needs and rights. As we pointed out, immigration, and by extension immigrants, are blamed for the city's traffic congestion, inadequate schooling and medical facilities, and unaffordable housing. Such a view is normalised through authoritative statements from politicians and reporters, while the rhetorical strategies used to discuss solutions abstracted the issues to immigration policy and practices and removed the individual from discussions. Rather than framing issues in ways that recognise the subjectivity and agency of migrants who, like all people, have basic needs for a home, education for their children and medical care, and who also need to travel to/from work, the dominant discourses portray immigration as simply 'clogging up' the city and taking up vital resources. This raises a clear tension between wanting the economic contributions of migrants and an unwillingness to account for and cater to migrants' needs.

The third major theme identified was fraudulent and/or exploitative practices. Although the previous themes were firmly located within economic discourse, reports on such practices were far more likely to account for the impact of fraud and exploitation on migrants themselves. Incidences of fraud and exploitation that constituted the majority of the articles reporting on criminal activities more broadly positioned immigrants in complex relationships with the law – as innocent victims, as perpetrators and, in many cases, as both. The fact that various viewpoints and arguments were reported signalled the complex nature of human behaviour and decision-making. That said, it is worthy of note that the activities remain centrally focused on migrants' engagement with the labour market and the overarching concerns remains with the New Zealand economy and 'local' citizens.

These dominant discourses reveal paradoxical concerns that stem largely from the normalisation of economic imperatives that underpinned changes to immigration policy in 1987 (Spoonley & Bedford, 2012). This is evident in the interests in maximising the economic benefits of immigration as well as, to a far lesser extent, the concurrent concerns about the welfare of immigrants. But it is instructive to consider the influence the economic reductionism and dehumanisation of immigrants might have on the experiences and lives of migrants here. Smith (2011) argues that dehumanisation enables 'the other' to be excluded from the community and exposes them to the potential of violence and inhumane treatment. Taking this into consideration, the economic value placed on immigrants has shaped the circumstances of their inclusion in wider society. Moreover, this value is also reflected in immigration policy, as illustrated by the changes to the skilled migrant visa rules that prioritise wealth over needed skill sets. Given the power that mainstream media has in moulding public perceptions and opinions (Happer & Philoa, 2013), casting immigrants as dehumanised economic objects may diminish our collective capacity to extend compassion towards the other and may facilitate support for policies that disregard the rights, needs, aspirations, and humanity of immigrants.

References

- Aly, A. (2017). Australian Muslim Responses to the Discourse on Terrorism in the Australian Popular Media. *Australian Journal of Social Issues*, 42(1), 27-40. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1839-4655.2007.tb00037.x.
- Auckland Chamber of Commerce (2016). *Business Update*. See: https://www.aucklandchamber.co.nz/media/46303524/business-update-29-november-2016.pdf.
- Auckland Council. (2017). *Auckland Growth Monitor: A snapshot into Auckland's economy and place on the world stage* [Report]. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland Council.
- Auckland Council (2018). *Auckland Plan 2050 evidence report: Belonging and participation*. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland Council. See: https://www.aucklandcouncil.govt.nz/plans-projects-policies-reports-bylaws/our-plans-strategies/auckland-plan/about-the-auckland-plan/Evidence%20reports%20documents/evidence-report-belonging-participation.pdf
- Banda, F., & Mawadza, A. (2015). 'Foreigners are stealing our birth right': Moral panics and the discursive construction of Zimbabwean immigrants in South African media. *Discourse and Communication*, *9*(1), 47-64. DOI: org/10.1177/1750481314555263.
- Bedford, R., & Didham. R. (2018). Immigration: An election issue that has yet to be addressed? Kōtuitui: New Zealand Journal of Social Sciences Online, 13(2), 177-194. DOI: 10.1080/1177083X.2018.1503606.
- Bleich, E., Bloemraad, I., & Graauw, E. (2015). Migrants, minorities and the media: Information, representations and participation in the public sphere. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 41(6), 857-873. doi:10.1080/1369183X.2014.1002197
- Bloemraad, I., Graauw, E., & Hamlin, R. (2015). Immigrants in the media: Civic visibility in the USA and Canada. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, *41*(6), 874-896, DOI: 10.1080/1369183X.2014.1002198.
- Cochrane, W., & Poot, J. (2016). Past research on the impact of international migration on house prices: Implications for Auckland [Report]. Wellington, New Zealand: Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment.
- de Vreese, C., Esser, F., Aalberg, T., Reinemann, C., & Stanyer, J. (2018). Populism as an expression of political communication content and style: A new perspective. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 23(4), 423–438.
- Du Fresne, K. (2017). *New Zealand papers are in dangerous decline here's what's at stake*. See: https://www.noted.co.nz/money/business/new-zealand-papers-are-in-dangerous-decline-heres-whats-at-stake/.
- Gooder, C. (2017). *Immigration, ethnic diversity and cities: A literature review for Auckland Council* [TR2017/008]. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland Council.
- Happer, C. & Philo, G. (2013). The role of the media in the construction of public belief and social change. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology*, *1*(1), 321-336.
- Hodder, R. & Krupp, J. (2017). *The New New Zealanders: Why Migrants Make Good Kiwis*. Wellington, New Zealand: The New Zealand Initiative.

- International Organization for Migration. (2015). World Migration Report 2015. Geneva, Switzerland:
 International Organization for Migration. See:
 http://publications.iom.int/system/files/wmr2015 en.pdf
- Johnson, A. (2016). *Addressing New Zealand's youth employment* [report]. Auckland, New Zealand: Salvation Army.
- Maydell, E. (2017). 'We need engineers, not Russian brides': Cultural stereotypes in New Zealand print media and what the engineers have to say. *Communication Research and Practice*, 3(4), 335-357. doi:10.1080/22041451.2016.1228995
- Saeed, A. (2007). Media, racism and Islamophobia: The representation of Islam and Muslims in the media. *Sociology Compass*, 1/2,443-462. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1751-9020.2007.00039.x
- Smith, D.L. (2014). Dehumanization, essentialism, and moral psychology. *Philosophy Compass*, *9*(11), 814-824. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/phc3.12174
- Smith, P.K. (2016). 'New Zealand passport holder' versus 'New Zealander'? The marginalization of ethnic minorities in the news: A New Zealand case study. *Journalism*, *17*(6), 694-710. DOI: 10.1177/1464884915582357.
- Spoonley, P., & Bedford, R. (2012). *Welcome to our world? Immigration and the reshaping of New Zealand*. Auckland, New Zealand: Dunmore Publishing.
- Statistics New Zealand. (2017). 2013 Census: Quick stats about Auckland region. See: http://archive.stats.govt.nz/Census/2013-census/profile-and-summary-reports/quickstats-about-a-place.aspx?request_value=13170&tabname=&sc_device=pdf.
- Stringer, C. (2016). *Worker Exploitation in New Zealand*: A Troubling Landscape [Prepared for the Human Trafficking Research Coalition]. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University.
- Tasan-Kok, T., van Kempen, R., Raco, M., & Bolt, G. (2013). *Towards hyper-diversified European cities: A critical literature review*. Utrecht, The Netherlands: Utrecht University, Faculty of Geosciences.
- Van Kingeren, M., Boomgaarden, H.G., Vliegenthart, R., & Vreese, C.H. (2015). Real world is not enough: The media as an additional source of negative attitudes toward immigration, comparing Denmark and the Netherlands. *European Sociological Review, 31*(3), 268-283. doi:10.1093/esr/jcu089.
- Vertovec, S. (2007). Superdiversity and its implications. Ethnic and Racial Studies, 30(6), 1024-1054.

Appendix: Bibliography

- Akoorie, N. (2017, 2 July) Leslie Smith is battling immigration officials to stay in New Zealand. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11883116
- An, J. (2017, 24 March) Jin An: Make skills, family focus for immigration policy. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11824317
- Blackstock, R. (2017, 22 January) What does the Trump factor mean for Kiwis? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11785065
- Boot, S. (2016, 21 September) Annual net migration rises in August on arrivals from Australia, UK and China. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11714069
- Bradley, G. (2017, 3 May) Tourism businesses should pay more to hold staff says expert. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11848664
- Carville, O. (2016, 15 September) Guilty: First human trafficking convictions in New Zealand. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11710423
- Carville, O. (2016, 14 December) Uncovered: Exploitation of migrant workers rife in NZ. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11766210
- Carville, O. (2016, 15 December) Nine years' jail for first person convicted of human trafficking in New Zealand. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www2.nzherald.co.nz/the-country/news/article.cfm?c id=16&objectid=11767537
- Chaudhuri, A. (2017, 15 February) Ananish Chaudhuri: Immigration should have checked Indian students' visas. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11800361
- Chaudhuri, A. (2017, 6 April) Ananish Chaudhuri: Let's explode some myths about immigration. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/opinion/news/article.cfm?c id=466&objectid=11832190
- Christian, D. (2017, 22 April) Journeys of understanding fostered by exhibition. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/entertainment/news/article.cfm?c_id=1501119&objectid=11842627
- Collins, F. (2017, 21 April) Francis Collins: We are creating a guestworker programme. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/opinion/news/article.cfm?c_id=466&objectid=11841828
- Collins, S. (2016, 22 July) Asian families face anxiety. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11679004

- Collins, S. (2016, 2 October) Students target Indian MP to fight deportation. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11721076
- Collins, S. (2016, 19 October) Migrants 'crowding out' young Kiwis from jobs Salvation Army. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11730577
- Collins, S. (2017, 3a February) Deported Indian students: 'We haven't told our parents how can we?'. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11794333
- Collins, S. (2017, 3b February) Parents and 2-year-old girl face deportation in student visa fraud. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11794073
- Collins, S. (2017, 9 February) Labour leader Andrew Little makes lastditch appeal for Indian students facing deportation. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11797704
- Collins, S. (2017, 13 February) Church leaders call for rethink on deporting Indian students. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11799678
- Collins, S. (2017, 15 February) Indian student detained pending deportation. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11800903
- Collins, S. (2017, 16 February) Stalemate over Indian students facing deportation for immigration fraud. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11801738
- Collins, S. (2017, 16 May) Business school with mainly Indian clientele closed by NZQA. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11857008
- Collins, S. (2017, 12 June) 'They don't really come here to get educated' Indian student. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11874881
- Collins, S. (2017, 14 June) Exploited students 'sleeping in cars' Immigration staff. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11875785
- Conchie, S. (2017, 12 June) Bay leaders question Labour's immigration plan. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/employment/news/article.cfm?c_id=11&objectid=11874722
- Cone, D. (2017, 24 April) Deborah Hill Cone: On immigration we're looking in the wrong queue. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11843688

- Dann, L. (2016, 22 August) Liam Dann: Brits keen on NZ, but who do we really want? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11698761
- Dann, L. (2017, 30 January) Should migrants pay for infrastructure costs? *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11790031
- Dann, L. (2017, 19 April) Liam Dann: Immigration change is shrewd politics. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11841134
- Dann, L. (2017, 30 April) Liam Dann: Let's lead the world on immigration debate. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11846099
- Dann, L. (2017, 4 May) Many migrant workers to lose pathway to residency. See: *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11849330
- Dann, L. (2017, 21 May) Liam Dann: Housing slowdown rides into town for Nats. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11858242
- Dann, L. (2017, 22 June) Net migration hits another record above 72,000, so why has Auckland housing stalled? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11880489
- Davison, I. (2016, 8 July) Housing crisis: Reserve Bank calls on Government to curb immigration. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11670579
- Davison, I. (2016, 10 August) Migrants not to blame for Auckland's house prices, study finds. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11691145
- Davison, I. (2017, 27 February) PM defends net migration levels, says foreign workers needed because Kiwis failing drug tests. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www2.nzherald.co.nz/the-country/news/article.cfm?c id=16&objectid=11808550
- Davison, I. (2017, 28 February) Just 466 failed drug tests since 2013, Ministry of Social Development says. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11809291.
- Duncan, G. (2016, 10 November) Future New Zealand: New Zealand's multiple housing crises. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11743228
- du Plessis-Allan, H. (2016, 4 December) Heather du Plessis-Allan: NZ not immune to rise of rightism. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11760087

- du Plessis-Allan, H. (2017, 23 April) Heather du Plessis-Allan: Immigration isn't the problem, housing is. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11842509
- Edwards, B. (2016, 8 September) Political Roundup: Brown lives matter. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11706097
- Edwards, B. (2016, 20 October) Political Roundup: Is it racist to oppose immigration? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11732790
- Edwards, B. (2016, 27 October) Political Roundup: Is New Zealand a good place for business or workers? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11736961
- Edwards, S. (2017, 23 June) Federated Farmers: Filipino couple epitomise immigration benefits. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www2.nzherald.co.nz/the-country/news/article.cfm?c id=16&objectid=11871351
- Ell, S. (2017, 26 June) Flying blind for the good of the firm. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11882056
- Feek, B. (2017, 31 January) Immigration fraudster gets jail then deportation to Fiji Hamilton News. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www2.nzherald.co.nz/hamilton-news/news/article.cfm?c id=1503366&objectid=11791845
- Feek, B. (2017a, 4 April) Immigration fraudster avoids jail. The New Zealand Herald. Retrieved from: https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11831358
- Feek, B. (2017b, 4 April) Big Read: How immigration fraudster Loraine Jayme got 17 migrants to NZ on fake jobs. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11826073
- Fisher, D. (2017, 20 March) 'Plan B' to get Dotcom out of New Zealand drags on for 29 months. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11821364
- Fong, M. (2017, 5 April) Marisa Fong: We need to rethink the whole concept of diversity. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11831854
- Gibson, A. (2016, 8 July) Fletcher heads to UK on big recruitment drive. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11670287
- Gibson, A. (2016, 26 July) Ray White links up with China to sell more properties. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11681411
- Gibson, A. (2016, 30 November) Immigration curbs rejected by Housing Minister Nick Smith. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11757685

- Gray, J. (2017, 1 February) Migration seen underpinning NZ growth. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11792037
- Gray, J. (2017, 1 May) NZ dairy farmers face challenges in election year. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11848256
- Hall, C. (2017, 29 May) Another 12,000 skilled workers needed for Bay of Plenty. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11864047
- Hill, B. (2016, 3 September) Protest for students booted out over visa scam. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11703389
- HBT (2017, 22 March) Company director gets home detention over exploitation of Indian immigrants. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11822657
- HBT (2017, 24 March) Immigrant workers felt helpless during exploitation. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11824043
- Hickey, B. (2016, 21 August) Bernard Hickey: Too many visas, not enough pay. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11697962
- Higgins, N. (2017, 20 April) Nadine Higgins: Immigration tweaks do nothing to ease crisis of creaking infrastructure. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11841628
- Hisco, D. (2016, 20 July) David Hisco: Housing and NZ dollar overcooked. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11678081
- Hosking, M. (2017, 11 May) Mike Hosking: Little's immigration 'breather' puts our economy in danger. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11853337
- Huo, R. (2017, 22 June) Raymond Huo: Student visas have become a backdoor to citizenship. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/opinion/news/article.cfm?c id=466&objectid=11880026
- Hurley, S. (2017, 1 March) Masala-linked companies forfeit \$8m in North Island property. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11809316
- Hurley, S. (2017, 10 June) Blind 5-year-old, described as a 'burden' on NZ health system, to be deported to South Africa. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11873934

- Jones, N. (2016, 15 August) Chinese Auckland comments 'not helpful' Greens. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11694077
- Jones, N. (2017, 19 April) Immigration changes slammed as 'tinkering' by New Zealand First, Labour.

 The New Zealand Herald. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11840831
- Jones, N. (2017, 20 April) Andrew Little: Labour will stop 'tens of thousands' of immigrants from coming to NZ. The New Zealand Herald. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11841890
- Jones, N. (2017, 21 April) Act's David Seymour condemns National for starting 'populist bidding war' on immigration. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11842659
- Jones, N. (2017, 27 April) Winston Peters' attack on journalists typical and calculated, Prime Minister Bill English says. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11846366
- Kneer, L. (2017, 20 April) Comment: Why are so many New Zealanders so scared of immigrants? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11841825
- Laxon, A. (2016, 5 December) Student visa fraud: 'It's not about education'. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11759352
- Laxon, A. (2016, 6a December) 'Sleep with me if you want your visa' boss tells student worker. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11760729
- Laxon, A. (2016, 6b December) 'Systemic plagiarism' and overcrowding at international school says NZQA. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11760874
- Laxon, A. (2017, 3 May) Too many international students immigrating to NZ, say officials. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11810806
- Leask, A. (2017, 1 May) Parole conditions tightened for repeat sex offender who escaped deportation. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11848022
- Little, A. (2017, 8 May) Andrew Little: Time to take a breather on immigration. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11851472
- McClymont, A. (2016, 6 July) Alastair McClymont: Beware ignorant debate on motivated migrants. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11669651

- Miller, C. (2017, 23 January) A long voyage: Refugees arrive home in Aotearoa. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11785824
- Nichol, T. (2017, 1 May) Another win for Cassia in Auckland's Metro restaurant awards. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/lifestyle/news/article.cfm?c_id=6&objectid=11848237
- Nichols, L. and Fletcher, H. (2016, 6 July) Masala mansions pulled from sale following asset freeze. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11669192
- NZ Herald (2016, 7 July) Reserve bank: Migration key to housing crisis. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11670498
- NZ Herald (2016, 14 August) Auckland too much like China says Chinese immigrant and real estate agent. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11693726
- NZ Herald (2016, 1 September) Racism in NZ: Over 400 complaints a year. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11702423
- NZ Herald (2016, 29 September) What our Auckland mayoral candidates want to offer our communities. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11716937
- NZ Herald (2016, 2 October) Goff: Foreign investors should only be allowed to build new houses. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11721048
- NZ Herald (2016, 23 November) Muslim cleric stood down over anti-Semitic comments. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11753529
- NZ Herald (2016, 25 November) Our thriving economy needs skilled talent. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11755030
- NZ Herald (2016, 4 December) Utopia divided: What costs of playground for millionaire migrants? *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11749267
- NZ Herald (2016, 23 December) Filipino woman fined \$10,000, ordered to pay \$5000 to underpaid sushi restaurant workers. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11772381
- NZ Herald (2017, 21 January) Cultural heritage reflected in commercial property trends. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/property/news/article.cfm?c id=8&objectid=11785918

- NZ Herald (2017, 31 January) NZ tourism, immigration hit fresh records in calendar 2016. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11791836
- NZ Herald (2017, 6 February) Church harbouring illegal students appeals to Government to show leniency. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11795398
- NZ Herald (2017, 13 February) Mai Chen: Super diverse women are the future. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11799338
- NZ Herald (2017, 15 February) Employers benefit from diverse workforce. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11800569
- NZ Herald (2017, 16 February) Super Diverse Women Q&A: Barbara Ala'alatoa. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11801268
- NZ Herald (2017, 23 February) New sanctions on bosses who exploit migrant workers: Immigration Minister Michael Woodhouse. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11806130
- NZ Herald (2017, 2 March) Whangarei house seized to pay Masala debt. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11809937
- NZ Herald (2017, 8 April) Editorial: Auckland's growth problems can be fixed. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/opinion/news/article.cfm?c id=466&objectid=11834166
- NZ Herald (2017, 11 April) Kaitaia caregiver given two days to get out of the country. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11836018
- NZ Herald (2017, 13 April) Final plea to immigration for Kaitaia caregiver. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11837672
- NZ Herald (2017, 16 April) Labour Party election fraudster's immigration job-selling scam case to be reheard. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11839268
- NZ Herald (2017, 19a April) Immigration changes could see a rush to apply for skilled migrant visas ahead of new rules. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11841168
- NZ Herald (2017, 19b April) Immigration changes will protect Kiwi workers, says Business NZ. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11840951

- NZ Herald (2017, 20b April) Immigration changes: How it will affect workers, Michael Woodhouse touts benefits. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11841268
- NZ Herald (2017, 29 April) Weekend Herald editorial: NZ has to prepare for 5 million people. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11847221
- NZ Herald (2017, 4 May) Farmers: Migrant labour still needed. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www2.nzherald.co.nz/the-country/news/article.cfm?c id=16&objectid=11850081
- NZ Herald (2017, 19 May) Immigration NZ investigates Chinese newspaper ad seeking marriage in exchange for residence. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11859292
- NZ Herald (2017, 5 June) Queen's Birthday Honours: Giving a voice to the Indian community. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11868129
- NZ Herald (2017, 14 June) Dozens of employers under Immigration NZ investigation for alleged immigration fraud. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11876111
- NZ Herald (2017, 15 June) Urgency needed on skill shortages. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/sponsored-stories/news/article.cfm?c id=1503708&objectid=11876561
- NZ Herald (2017, 16 June) Landlord sublet garage to new immigrants, 'harassed, intimidated' them. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11877321
- O'Brien, E. (2016, 3 November) Is New Zealand the new haven for the world's mega rich? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11741144
- Orsman, B. (2016, 28 August) Cut immigration to ease housing woes, says Auckland mayoral candidate Phil Goff. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11701171
- Orsman, B. (2017, 8 April) Traffic chaos: A third of Auckland's main roads will be congested by 2020.

 The New Zealand Herald. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11834114
- Orsman, B. (2017, 9 April) Labour Party promises to cut immigration. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11834706
- O'Sullivan, F. (2016, 20 August) Fran O'Sullivan: Time for action on money laundering. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11697454

- O'Sullivan, F. (2017, 21 April) Fran O'Sullivan: Forget immigration, let's talk wages. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11842907
- O'Sullivan, F. (2017, 29 April) Fran O'Sullivan: PM needs to think about kingmaker. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11847306
- Parker, T. (2017, 7 June) Few listed companies part of diversity in the workplace push. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11871084
- Penn, J. (2016, 27 September) Mood of the Boardroom: Targeting the right skills crucial. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11716811
- Phillips, G. (2017, 31 May) 'He has destroyed my life': Auckland woman hounded by refugee. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11866718
- Rudman, B. (2016, 21 December) Brian Rudman: Government's new housing ploy blame the market. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11770561
- Ryan, H. (2017, 20 April) New immigration rules could hurt the trucking sector. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11841776
- Savage, J. (2016, 23 August) Citizen Yan to pay police nearly \$43m. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11699236
- Savage, J. (2016, 11 December) Drug ring 'puppet master' led to William Yan's \$43m settlement with police. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11763071
- Savage, J. (2017, 19 March) Identity of Ecstasy drug MDMA smuggler revealed as Jan Antolik, kickboxer with false passport. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11818806
- Savage, J. (2017, 25 March) 'Lewd act' Bimal Roy Prasad lived in New Zealand under false name. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11825448
- Savage, J. (2017, 10 May) Controversial citizen William Yan AKA Bill Liu admits money laundering of 'significant sums'. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11835412
- Savage, J. & Taylor, P. (2016, 3 October) Hammer assault case: Yasir Mohib fears for family's future.

 The New Zealand Herald. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11721592

- Shallcrass, J. (2017, 21 June) Julia Shallcrass: Why aren't more companies embracing diversity? *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11880135
- Sharp, N. (2017, 2 March) Dairy farmers are struggling to recruit good staff locally The Country. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www2.nzherald.co.nz/the-country/news/article.cfm?c id=16&objectid=11810563
- Shaw, A. (2016, 20 July) IT salaries drop 2pc as global talent arrives. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11677903
- Shaw, A. (2016, 10 August) Business leader says immigration rules need a shakeup. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11690825
- Shaw, A. (2016, 27 September) Mood of the Boardroom: Globalisation will have greatest impact on business. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11716192
- Shaw, A. (2017, 20 April) Hospitality, retail will feel impact of immigration change, experts say. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11841648
- Shaw, A. (2017, 2 June) Former Urban Turban worker wins \$40,000 payout. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11868156
- Smalley, R. (2017, 16 February) Rachel Smalley: Indian students need to go. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11801673
- Smellie, P. (2016, 22 November) Too much migration discourages investment in high-value businesses: Treasury. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11752828
- Tan, L. (2016, 9 August) Auckland gains 600 new migrants a week. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11690369
- Tan, L. (2016, 22 August) Chinese community fear for safety following spate of crime, says Auckland researcher. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11698917
- Tan, L. (2016, 9 October) Garage business turned into \$15 million operation. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11724679
- Tan, L. (2016, 15 October) Auckland Diwali Festival now a 'mega event'. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11727654

- Tan, L. (2016, 20 October) New Zealand girl faces deportation because of mother's lie to immigration. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11732795
- Tan, L. (2016, 29 October) Masala restaurant boss Rupinder Singh Chahil sentenced over exploitation. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11737727
- Tan, L. (2017, 8 January) Miss Universe New Zealand Tania Dawson thinks she has what it takes to win the coveted international title in the Philippines. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/lifestyle/news/article.cfm?c_id=6&objectid=11777724
- Tan, L. (2017, 15 January) Foreign students left in lurch. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11781255
- Tan, L. (2017, 27 January) Chinese New Year: Goodbye Monkey, Hello Rooster. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11786717
- Tan, L. (2017, 30 January) Beyond the fear factor: New Kiwis can be good for us all. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11788673
- Tan, L. (2017, 31 January) Immigration: Four perspectives from the front. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:
 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11788667
- Tan, L. (2017, 1 February) Do migrants dilute the New Zealand identity? *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11788679
- Tan, L. (2017, 8 February) Lantern festival ready to light up Auckland Domain to celebrate Year of the Rooster. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11796119
- Tan, L. (2017, 14a February) Super Diverse Women Q&A: Rez Gardi. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11799891
- Tan, L. (2017, 14b February) Refugee and immigrant millennials in NZ struggling to get into high-paying jobs. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11799863
- Tan, L. (2017, 14c February) Ethnic and minority women face many different forms of discrimination in New Zealand. The New Zealand Herald. Retrieved from:
 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11799853
- Tan, L. (2017, 20 February) Kept apart: Sick parents can't visit kids in New Zealand. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11803722
- Tan, L. (2017, 16a March) Survey: Many Kiwis know little about Asia. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11818884

- Tan, L. (2017, 16b March) Quest to find out more about Asians and migrants. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11818906
- Tan, L. (2017, 4 April) Shincheonji members helped believer "escape" family. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11817395
- Tan, L. (2017, 27 April) Eating out could cost more after immigration changes kick in. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11846425
- Tan, L. (2017, 4 May) Many migrant workers to lose pathway to residency. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:
 - http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11849330
- Tan, L. (2017, 8 May) Survey: Filipino migrants happiest in NZ, Manurewa Auckland's happiest electorate. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11851665
- Tan, L. (2017, 24 May) Proposed immigration changes hit restaurant industry. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11862230
- Tan, L. (2017, 1 June) Would-be tenant faces strict rules about drugs, noise and parties because she's Brazilian. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11866739
- Tan, L. (2017, 25 June) Auckland Muslims feed homeless ahead of Eid ul Fitr. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11881761
- Tan, L. (2017, 28 June) Chinese builder jailed for immigration fraud living unlawfully in NZ since 2005. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11883170
- Tan, L. and Singh, H. (2017, 26 April) Top source countries for migrant workers are not Asian. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11842859
- Tapaleao, V. (2016, 27 October) Cash in while you can: Agent uses immigration rules to sell houses. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11737196
- Taylor, P. (2016, 15 October) Are New Zealanders becoming more racist? *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11727657
- Taylor, P. (2017, 30 June) Auckland baby smuggler married to alleged 'drug lord'. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11880757

- Theunissen, M. (2016, 3 November) Construction industry crying out for skilled workers, says Hawkins boss Geoff Hunt. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11741553
- Theunissen, M. (2017, 8 March) Pay \$25k or work for free, man allegedly told. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c id=3&objectid=11813661
- Trevett, C. (2016, 5 November) Prime Minister says Labour's proposed levy on businesses that relied on overseas workers "not sensible". *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11742795
- Trevett, C. (2017, 13 May) Andrew Little dismisses 'metro schools' idea at Labour Congress. *The New Zealand Herald.* Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11855417
- Twose, H. (2017, 3 March) Executive Success: Embracing diversity in a rush. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/business/news/article.cfm?c_id=3&objectid=11810016
- Wade, A. (2016, 31 October) Woman pleads guilty to abandoning children. *The New Zealand Herald*.

 Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11739083
- Wiggins, A. (2017, 3 May) Auckland pharmacies accused of underpaying staff and not keeping proper employment records. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c id=1&objectid=11849442
- Young, A. (2017, 28 April) Finance Minister rules out tax cuts but lifts infrastructure spending. *The New Zealand Herald*. Retrieved from:

 http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=11846472